Selected Persistent Organic Pollutants in Ambient Air in Turkey:
Regional Sources and Controlling Factors


ABSTRACT: As a result of its unique location, Turkey receives air masses from Europe, Russia, Middle East, and Africa, making it an important place in terms of long-range atmospheric transport (LRT) of contaminants. Atmospheric levels of 22 organochlorine pesticides (OCPs), 45 polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), and 14 polybrominated diphenyl ethers (PBDEs) were measured in two metropolitan cities, Istanbul and Izmir, on a weekly basis from May 2014 to May 2015. Dichlorodiphenyltrichloroethane (DDT) and its derivatives were dominant OCP species, followed by isomers of hexachlorocyclohexane (HCH) at both sites. The annual mean concentration of $\sum$DDX (sum of $o,p'$-DDT, $p,p'$-DDT, $o,o'$-DDE, and $p,p'$-DDE) was 82 pg/m$^3$ for Istanbul and 89 pg/m$^3$ for Izmir, while these levels were about 46 pg/m$^3$ for $\sum$HCHs (sum of $\alpha$, $\beta$, $\gamma$, and $\delta$-HCH) at both of the sites. At both stations, tri- and tetra-PCBs and tetra- and penta-PBDEs were dominant congeners. The temperature dependence indicates that both LRT and local contaminated areas contribute to the elevated levels. A Lagrangian particle dispersion model (FLEXPART) showed a few potential source regions in northern Africa and Middle East, southern—southwestern and eastern Europe including Russia, as well as from local domestic metropolitan areas.

KEYWORDS: polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), polybrominated diphenyl ethers (PBDEs), organochlorine pesticides (OCPs), active sampling, particle dispersion modeling, Turkey

INTRODUCTION

Organochlorine pesticides (OCPs), polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs), and polybrominated diphenyl ethers (PBDEs) are persistent organic pollutants (POPs) that are noticeable with their thermal stability, acid-, alkali-, and hydrolysis-resistance. The published studies agree on spatial and seasonal variations of the PCBs and PBDEs. The discussed POPs, including PCBs, PBDEs, or most of the OCPs, but it became a party to the Stockholm Convention as of 2010, resulting in the responsibility for prohibition/elimination/restriction of use of certain POPs, environmentally sound management of stockpiles/wastes, monitoring of POPs levels and preparation, and revision of a national implementation plan. Therefore, determination of POPs in the environmental media in Turkey has received increased attention, resulting in many studies reporting ambient air concentrations of OCPs, PCBs, and PBDEs.
PBDEs, some of which are cited here. The detected air concentrations were the results of contamination from past use, formation as a byproduct, and LRT from the countries where these compounds were produced and heavily used.

Turkey receives air masses from Europe, Russia, the Middle East, and Africa, so the goal of this study was to assess the levels of POPs and source regions for two major urban centers with different characteristics. For this purpose, OCP, PCB, and PBDE concentrations were measured for a year, and a Lagrangian particle dispersion-model, FLEXPART, was used to investigate LRT of the target chemicals. Istanbul is the largest metropolis in Turkey with a diverse industrial economy. Based on its location, LRT from different countries in Europe, Asia, and the Mediterranean region could carry persistent contaminants to the city. Izmir, the third most populated metropolis in Turkey, is surrounded with agricultural areas as well as chemical, steel scrap processing industries and two refineries. LRT from other countries is believed to be an important contributor for ambient air POP levels in Izmir.

MATERIALS AND METHODS

Chemicals and Reagents. All solvents were chromatography-grade and purchased from Merck (Merck EMD Millipore, Burlington, MA). Granular anhydrous Na₂SO₄ and alumina (90 active neutral, 0.063 to 0.2 mm particulate size) were also from Merck. Details on analytical standards of recovery surrogate ([^13]Cl⁻⁻⁻PCB-28, -52, -101, -138, -153, -180, and -209), and target chemicals are given in Supporting Information (SI) Table S1.

Study Area and Sample Collection. Air samples were collected for a year between May 2014 and May 2015 at a suburban site (41°09′6.06″N, 29°7′58.08″E, located in Beykoz) in Istanbul (Figure 1, SI Table S3), and at a rural/coastal site (38°19′4.31″N, 26°38′17.71″E, located near the village of Gulbahce, which is about 60 km away from city center) in Izmir (Figure 1, SI Table S3). Samples were numbered with respect to sample collection date. Istanbul is the largest city in Turkey with a population of 15,029,231 which has the Mediterranean climate. The gross domestic product of Istanbul is significantly provided by the industry sector with a percentage of 30%, whereas the contribution of agriculture is only 1%. Izmir is the third most populous city in Turkey with a transitional climate between the Continental and Mediterranean. The gross domestic product of Istanbul is significantly provided by the industry sector with a percentage of 30%, whereas the contribution of agriculture is only 1%. Izmir is surrounded with agricultural areas as well as chemical, steel scrap processing industries and two refineries. Co-eluting congeners (PCB-41/64 and PCB-90/101) were present in the chromatogram. Further details are given in SI Table S4.

Analysis of compounds of interest was performed on a GC (Agilent 7890B) coupled with an MSD (Agilent 5977 MSD). Co-eluting congeners (PCB-41/64 and PCB-90/101) were quantified together. Further details on capillary column, instrument operating conditions are given in SI Table S5. Twenty-two OCP compounds, 45 PCB congeners, and 14 PBDE congeners were selected as target pollutants (SI Table S1) in this study.

Quality Assurance/Quality Control (QA/QC). Laboratory and field blank samples were processed along with the samples and details are given in SI Table S4. Method detection limit (MDL) values were calculated as average blank concentration plus three standard deviations for the compounds that were observed in blank samples. The instrumental detection limits (IDLs) are the analyte concentrations that reported by the USEPA against contamination. The PUF plugs were cleaned up on Soxhlet apparatus using a series of solvent while GFF filters were baked at 450 °C for at least 12 h before use. Target chemicals were extracted from PUF plugs using hexane (HEX):acetone (ACE) (1:1) mixture while GFFs were extracted using dichloromethane (DCM).[^13]Cl⁻⁻⁻PCB-28, -52, -101, -138, -153, -180, and -209 (50 ng each) was added to each sample to check the recovery rates. Each sample was reduced to ~1 mL using rotary evaporator and under a gentle stream of N₂ gas. Column chromatography cleanup was carried out using 3 g of 6% deactivated alumina and column was eluted using 35 mL of 20% DCM in HEX. Final volume was 1 mL in isooctane, and all samples were spiked with 50 ng of[^13]Cl⁻⁻⁻PCB 105 as internal standard. Further details are given in SI Table S5.

Air was sampled once a week for a 24 h period by using high-volume (High-Vol) samplers (Thermo-Andersen model GPS-11 in Izmir, and Tisch Environmental TE-1000BLX in Istanbul), approximately 220 m³ per sample in Izmir and approximately 287 m³ per sample in Istanbul sampling site. Glass fiber filters (GFFs, 10.2 cm in diameter) and polyethylene foam plugs (PUF plug, 5.5 cm in diameter and 5 cm in length) were the sampling media. Two PUF plugs were placed in series to evaluate and eliminate breakthrough.

Sample Preparation and Chemical Analysis. All equipment and glassware was cleaned according to methods given in Supporting Information (SI) Table S1.
Percent recovery efficiencies of recovery surrogate compounds from PUF plug samples \( (n = 129) \) ranged between 60.2% and 140% \( (87.5 \pm 15.1\%) \) whereas the values ranged 59.6−139% \( (87.8 \pm 16.5\%) \) for GFFs \( (n = 113) \). The target analytes were not corrected for surrogate or procedural recoveries. Further details on recovery of individual surrogates are given in SI Table S4. A detection frequency of at least 25% was required for inclusion in the data analyses. Due to acceptable rates of breakthrough, gas phase concentrations were calculated as the sum of concentrations detected in top and bottom PUF plugs.

**LRT Modeling.** The Lagrangian particle dispersion model FLEXPART, version 8, was used for LRT modeling. The model was run in backward mode, in order to identify the source regions of air pollutants at the sampling location. For every sample, 1 particle per second \( (86400 \text{ per sample}) \) were released, randomly between 0 and 200 m and their trajectories computed for 5 days back in time (SI Figures S1 and S2). FLEXPART model was driven with analyses from the European Centre for Medium-Range Weather Forecasts (ECMWF) 3-hly analyses with \( 1^\circ \times 1^\circ \) resolution. The FLEXPART output resolution was set to hourly and the following vertical levels: 100, 200, 500, 1000, 2000, 5000, 10,000, and 15,000 m. The results are shown as plots of the residence time, which is a measure of the times particles resided in a grid cell. The prediction of source regions was made by using the Istanbul and Izmir samples with \( \geq95\% \) percentile values of \( \sum \text{DDX} \) (sum of \( o,p'-\text{DDT}, p,p'-\text{DDT}, o,p''-\text{DDT}, p,p''-\text{DDD}, p,p''-\text{DDE}, \sum \chi \text{HCHs} \) (sum of \( \alpha-, \beta-, \gamma-, \text{and } \delta-\text{HCH}, \sum \chi \text{PCBs}, \text{and } \sum \chi \text{PBDEs gas-phase concentrations} \) (SI Figures S3−S5).

**RESULTS AND DISCUSSION**

In this article, unless otherwise stated, the concentrations reported are totals - the sum of gas and particle phase concentrations.

**Ambient Air POP Concentrations.** OCPs. The levels of selected OCP compounds in Istanbul and in Izmir are shown in SI Figure S6 while the monthly OCP levels are given in SI Figure S7 (for Istanbul) and SI Figure S8 (for Izmir). Compounds with detection frequencies <25%, that is, aldrin, HEPX (heptachlor epoxide), and endoSO\(_4\) (endosulfan sulfate), are not reported. Annual average concentration of \( \sum \chi \text{OCPs} \) in Istanbul and Izmir (Figure 1) were \( 264 \pm 158 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) \( (\text{nd}-670 \text{ pg/m}^3) \) and \( 323 \pm 348 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) \( (\text{nd}-1350 \text{ pg/m}^3) \), respectively. The dominant OCP compounds were determined as \( \sum \chi \text{DDX} \) and \( \sum \chi \text{HCHs} \) at both sampling stations. The most of detected OCP compounds have not been used in Turkey due to the restrictions and bans since 1970s−1980s.\(^{28}\) A seasonal trend was not observed for any of the target OCP compounds, except for endrin in Istanbul. On the other hand, the ambient concentrations of most OCP compounds in Izmir station, such as DDTs, HCHs, HEPT (heptachlor), endrin, dieldrin, and \( \beta\)-endo \( (\beta\)-endosulfan), reached the maximum values in January−February 2015. A sharp rise in many targeted OCP compounds \( (p,p'-\text{DDE}, \text{endrin}, \text{CC (cis-chlordane), TC (trans-chlordane), } \alpha\text{-endo } (\alpha\text{-endosulfan}), \beta\text{-endo, endoSO}_4, \text{ and mirex} ) \) levels occurred on July 12, 2014 (sample no. 10) in Izmir, which was an unexplained episodic situation (even when considering air mass analysis). These values, exceeding annual mean levels by more than a factor of 14 to 102, were not considered in the calculations.

The dominant OCP was found as \( \sum \chi \text{DDX} \) with an annual mean level of \( 82.2 \pm 87.7 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) and \( 89.2 \pm 121 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) in Istanbul and Izmir, respectively. DDT has been banned in Turkey since 1985.\(^{28}\) However, it might still be used in developing countries for agricultural and sanitary purposes due to its low price and effectiveness.\(^{29}\) For the Istanbul station, April and March were resulted in higher monthly \( \sum \chi \text{DDX} \) levels as \( 186 \pm 90 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) and \( 155 \pm 108 \text{ pg/m}^3 \), respectively. For the Izmir station, the monthly \( \sum \chi \text{DDX} \) levels were as high as \( 237 \pm 69 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) in March 2015, \( 200 \pm 164 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) in January 2015, and \( 166 \pm 153 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) in February 2015.

The use of dicofol is an emission source of DDT and its isomers, particularly \( o,p'-\text{DDT}. \)\(^{30,31}\) The \( o,p'-\text{DDT}/p,p'-\text{DDT} \) ratio for 14 different dicofol formulations used in Turkey was reported to range from 0.1 to 2.1.\(^{32}\) In this study, the \( o,p'-\text{DDT}/p,p'-\text{DDT} \) ratio was 0.008 for Istanbul and 0.004 for Izmir, indicating minor influence of dicofol on air advected to these sites. The mean values for ratios of DDE/DDT and DDD/DDT were calculated as 0.34 and 0.08 for Istanbul, and 0.72 and 0.06 for Izmir, respectively. Therefore, DDT had been broken down and mostly converted to DDE over time. In Europe and elsewhere long after DDT ban, DDE now dominates DDX species in the abiotic environment.\(^{32}\)

HCHs were the second most dominant OCP group with annual mean concentrations of \( 45.2 \pm 37.6 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) and \( 46.6 \pm 79.2 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) in Istanbul and Izmir, respectively. The use of HCH was banned in 1985 in Turkey.\(^{28}\) The highest monthly \( \sum \chi \text{HCHs} \) level was measured as \( 77.9 \pm 78.7 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) in July 2014 and \( 75.8 \pm 53.6 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) in March 2015 in Istanbul. A clear seasonality was not observed in HCH levels in Istanbul, similar to that of many targeted OCP compounds, which suggests that secondary sources (volatilization from soils which earlier received contaminated depositions) were not dominant,\(^{33}\) but advection was. Contrary to the highest \( \sum \chi \text{HCHs} \) level measured in Istanbul in July 2014, \( \sum \chi \text{HCHs} \) level in this month was comparably low \( (3.3 \pm 8.2 \text{ pg/m}^3) \) in Izmir. The highest monthly concentrations of HCHs were measured as \( 179 \pm 104 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) in January 2015, and \( 160 \pm 164 \text{ pg/m}^3 \) in February 2015 in Izmir. So, HCHs were detected at higher levels in the coldest months at Izmir station, on the contrary to the notion that higher concentrations occur with increase in temperature due to increasing volatilization from contaminated terrestrial surfaces to the atmosphere.\(^{34}\) Yao et al.\(^{35}\) investigated lindane concentrations for one year after the Canadian ban on lindane for agricultural use. In contrast with decrease of \( \gamma\)-HCH air concentrations over the Great Lakes region, during the sampling period a \( \gamma\)-HCH air pollution episode resulted in an increase of the concentration by 2 orders of magnitude suggesting a localized emission in the city from an unknown and episodic source.

Two targeted HCHs, \( \beta\)-, and \( \delta\)-HCH, were rarely encountered in the samples collected at both stations, whereas \( \alpha\)- and \( \gamma\)-HCH were quantified in most samples in accordance with other studies. The contribution of \( \gamma\)-HCH level to the
annual mean $\sum$HCHs concentration was found to be 52% and 66% in Istanbul and Izmir, respectively. The reported levels of $\alpha$-HCH in Turkey ranged from 17.3 ± 10.7 pg/m$^3$ (in 2005$^{19}$) to 111 ± 125 pg/m$^3$ (in 2003$^{16}$). The levels of $\alpha$-HCH measured in this study were lower at both sampling sites even compared to the minimum concentrations reported in previous studies.

PCBs. The mean concentration of $\sum_{45}$PCBs at each sampling event in Istanbul and Izmir (Figure 1) were 69.7 ± 69.6 pg/m$^3$ (nd-317 pg/m$^3$, 83% in gas phase (SI Figure S4)) and 207 ± 225 pg/m$^3$ (nd-880 pg/m$^3$, 93% in gas phase (SI Figure S4)), respectively. The most dominant congeners detected in ambient air were PCB 44 and PCB 18 at Istanbul station, while they were PCB-28, -18, and -22 at Izmir station (SI Figure S9). Tetra- followed by tri-CBs dominated the homologue pattern at both sites. The contribution of $\sum_{1}$ CBs and $\sum_{4}$ tetra-CBs to the $\sum_{45}$PCBs levels were found to be 28% and 46% in Istanbul; 30% and 33% in Izmir, respectively. Once deposited (or directly emitted) to soil, the higher chlorinated congeners (PCB-138, -149, -157, -158, etc.) remain close to the point of source.$^{13}$ In this study, penta-CBs to octa-CBs were observed at noteworthy levels during the sampling period, with 26% and 36% percent of the mean $\sum_{45}$PCBs levels at Istanbul and Izmir stations, respectively. The use of PCBs in Turkey has been banned since 1996. However, it may still be produced unintentionally as byproducts of thermal processes or industrial processes or it may outgas from old electric installations and buildings. Steel production from scrap with arc furnaces has been shown to emit PCBs$^{38}$ while the contaminated soils act as an important secondary source in summer.$^{39}$

Monthly mean concentrations of the targeted PCB homologues are shown in SI Figure S10. A rise in PCB concentrations may be anticipated in warmer sampling months at both stations. Compatible, the highest atmospheric PCB concentrations for most of the homologues were observed in August 2014 in Istanbul. However, the levels of PCBs in Izmir were higher in January and February 2015. The winter time concentration increase in Izmir could be attributed to the shallow mixing height, as well as southerly winds compared to the dominating northerly winds (SI Table S3). The monthly mean concentration of $\sum_{1}$ CBs was measured as 89 ± 59 pg/m$^3$ in August 2014 in Istanbul, approximately 2.8 times higher than its annual mean. The ratio for $\sum_{2}$ tri-, $\sum_{10}$ penta-, $\sum_{10}$ hexa-, and $\sum_{2}$ hepta-CBs ranged between 3.0 and 7.1. In Izmir, the highest monthly levels were found to be 136 ± 70 and 149 ± 26 pg/m$^3$ in January and February 2015, for $\sum_{2}$ tri-CBs with approximately 2.5 times higher than the annual mean concentration of $\sum_{2}$ tri-CBs. The ratio for the rest of the PCB homologue groups ranged between 2.0 and 4.4.

PBDEs. The mean $\sum_{14}$PBDEs level (Figure 1) was 10.8 ± 16.3 pg/m$^3$ (nd-73 pg/m$^3$, 62% residing in gas phase (SI Figure S5)) in Istanbul, and was 10.8 ± 16.6 pg/m$^3$ (nd-70.4 pg/m$^3$, 70% residing in gas phase (SI Figure S5)) in Izmir. There is no significant difference between the annual means of $\sum_{14}$PBDEs of the two sampling sites. A previous study conducted at the same sampling site as in this study in Izmir in July 2012$^{24}$ reported mean concentration of $\sum_{14}$PBDEs (-47, -99, and -100) as 8.5 pg/m$^3$. In spite of the prohibitions on tetra- and penta-BDEs, which are more toxic and bioaccumulative than the other congeners with large number of bromine atoms, their ($\sum_{14}$tetra-BDEs and $\sum_{14}$penta-BDEs) contributions were found to be the highest with 37% and 25% percent in Istanbul; 60% and 15% percent in Izmir, respectively, followed by $\sum_{14}$tri-BDEs having 13% percent at both sites. In most published studies and also studies in the Izmir area,$^{40}$ PBDE-209 was the dominating congener. However, although it was detected in samples in the current study, it was not the dominant congener in the samples. As shown in SI Figure S11, the annual mean concentrations of the most dominant congeners which are tetra-BDEs (BDE-66, -47, and -71) were measured around 1 pg/m$^3$ in Istanbul, and 1.5–2.5 pg/m$^3$ in Izmir. The commercial penta-BDE was mainly used as a flame retardant in polyurethanes for mattresses and cushioning in upholstered products.$^{43}$ Prior to the restrictions and bans, the commercial mixture of octa-BDE was usually used in electronics and plastic industries.$^{11}$ Over time, in goods but also in the atmosphere, they could degrade through debromination and convert to lower BDEs.$^{37}$ The targeted hexa- and hepta-BDEs (BDE-138, -153, -154, and -183) were hardly detected during the whole sampling period, except BDE-190. The annual mean concentration of deca-BDE (BDE-209) in Istanbul and Izmir was found as 1.44 ± 6.85 and 0.77 ± 3.95 pg/m$^3$, respectively. There was an interpretable seasonal variation in PBDE homologue concentrations for Istanbul station, whereas levels measured in Izmir station were not (SI Figure S12). The release of PBDE congeners to the atmosphere depends on human activities (e.g., manufacturing processes, recycling wastes, emitting from waste disposal sites), as well as volatilization from contaminated sites, rendering the monthly time series without a trend.

The unusual gas-particle partitioning results of $\sum$DDX (SI Figure S3a,c), $\sum$HCHs (SI Figure S3b,d), $\sum_{45}$PCBs (SI Figure S4), $\sum_{14}$PBDEs (SI Figure S5), and selected individual OCPs (SI Figure S6) at both sites for summer vs winter periods is unexpected but could be explained by uncontrolled parameters during the measurements, that is, concentration and composition of particulate organic matter (POM): gas–particle partitioning of nonpolar organics such as OCPs is dominated by absorption into POM$^{8,44}$ which can with some uncertainty (1 order of magnitude uncertainty in $K_{oa}$) be described by a simple-parameter linear free-energy relationship using the predictor $K_{oa}(T)$ as a surrogate for POM. The underlying molecular and phase processes are more complex, though. Indeed, at a given site which is dominated by regional transport (rather than local sources), POM varies not only in concentration (typically higher in summer because of more efficient gas-to-particle conversion of volatile organic compounds$^{35}$), but also in chemical composition, for example, the low to medium molecular weight fraction of POM, which absorbs most, may vary seasonally, and POM may separate into several organic phases.$^{36}$ Volatilization from particles may be suppressed by an organic film (eventually more likely to be formed in summer as driven by the abundance of biopolymers$^{47,48}$), while condensation of nonpolar substances on particles might be suppressed by wet aerosol (water sorbed to surface as a function of relative humidity, more relevant in winter time). For BDE-209, phase equilibrium cannot be expected, that is, more is found in the gas-phase than phase equilibrium suggests, due to kinetic constraints applying to substances of very high lipophilicity (log$K_{oa}$ > 11.5)$^{49,50}$ the more so for low concentrations of POM (more likely in winter).

Historical Variation. To our best knowledge, current study is the first one on OCPs related ambient air monitoring in Istanbul. Therefore, it is not possible to investigate historical
variation of OCP levels in ambient air of Istanbul. Previously, PCB levels were investigated in ambient air of Istanbul between May 2012 and May, 2013. The mean level of \( \sum_{8} \alpha \text{PCBs} \) in summer—autumn and winter—spring was reported to be 420 pg/m\(^3\) (88% in gas phase) and 360 pg/m\(^3\) (86% in gas phase), respectively. In the current study, these levels were found to be 117 pg/m\(^3\) (85% in gas phase) in summer—autumn and 15.5 pg/m\(^3\) (74% in gas phase) in winter—spring. However, it should be noted that number of the studied PCB congeners being different hinders the comparison. In contrast to the current study, the mean ambient air concentrations of \( \sum_{8} \alpha \text{PCBs} \) were high (260 ± 60 pg/m\(^3\)) in samples collected in February—March 2012 at an urban site (Besiktas) in Istanbul.

Izmir sampling site was among those of rural sites of the Global Atmospheric Passive Sampling (GAPS) study that collected samples over four seasons in 2005, using PUF disks. In 2005, the average \( \sum \alpha \text{HCHs} \) (sum of \( \alpha \)- and \( \gamma \)-HCH), \( \sum \alpha \text{DDTs} \) (sum of DDT and DDE isomers), and \( \sum \alpha \text{PCBs} \) (PCB-28, -52, -101, -118, -138, -153, and -180) were reported to be 29 pg/m\(^3\), 51 pg/m\(^3\), and 644 pg/m\(^3\) in winter; 48 pg/m\(^3\), 60 pg/m\(^3\), and 287 pg/m\(^3\) in summer, respectively. Moreover, in 2005, the concentration of \( \sum \alpha \text{PCBs} \) (PBDE-28, -47, -66, -100, and -99) for winter was not reported, while the average \( \sum \alpha \text{PCBs} \) level in summer was found to be below detection limit (BDL). The MDLs of PBDE 47 and PBDE 100 for the Izmir sampling site were in the range of 0–1 ng/PUF in the GAPS study. Also, IDLs for PBDEs were reported as <0.01 ng for PBDE-28, -47, -66, and <0.02 ng for PBDE-99 and -100. In a study conducted in July 2012, the average concentrations of \( \sum \alpha \text{HCHs} \) (sum of \( \alpha \)- and \( \gamma \)-HCH), \( \sum \alpha \text{DDTs} \) (sum of DDT and DDE isomers), \( \sum \alpha \text{PCBs} \) (PCB-28, -52, -101, -118, -138, -153, and -180) and \( \sum \alpha \text{PCBs} \) (PBDE-28, -47, -66, -100, and -99) were measured as 13.8 pg/m\(^3\), 12.9 pg/m\(^3\), 55.3 pg/m\(^3\), and 8.50 pg/m\(^3\), respectively. Comparison of the results of the current study to the average \( \sum \alpha \text{HCHs} \) levels measured in the summer of 2005 and 2012 in the two abovementioned studies showed that \( \sum \alpha \text{HCHs} \) ranged 14–41 pg/m\(^3\), while the average \( \sum \alpha \text{DDTs} \) levels ranged 13–60 pg/m\(^3\) in the 10-year time frame. Only one of the two previous studies reported wintertime concentrations but based on passive sampling. The average wintertime concentrations of \( \sum \alpha \text{HCHs} \) (133 ± 110 pg/m\(^3\)) and \( \sum \alpha \text{DDTs} \) (150 ± 142 pg/m\(^3\)) measured in this study in the winter of 2015 are 4.8 and 2.9 times higher than those measured in 2005. The mean \( \sum \alpha \text{PCBs} \) level of 14 ± 17 pg/m\(^3\) in summer 2015 is much lower than those of 2005 (287 pg/m\(^3\)) and 2012 (55 pg/m\(^3\)), while the difference in winter averages between 2005 (644 pg/m\(^3\)) and 2015 (100 pg/m\(^3\)) is less pronounced. The mean \( \sum \alpha \text{PCBs} \) level in winter was found to be 11.3 ± 13.7 pg/m\(^3\) in the current study, however, a corresponding value was not available from the GAPS study. The average summer \( \sum \alpha \text{PCBs} \) concentrations measured in 2015 (5.6 ± 6.7 pg/m\(^3\)) and 2012 (8.5 pg/m\(^3\)) are similar, but it was BDL in 2005.

Overall, the above comparisons among 2005, 2012, and 2015 at the same sampling site show that fairly similar levels with some fluctuations for OCPs and PBDEs, and for PCBs when the extreme levels measured in 2005 in the GAPS study are left out. The variability in concentrations, therefore, may indicate that different sources or source areas dominate at different times. A comparison of PCB levels measured at a suburban Izmir location in 2003 with those measured in 2012 at this site also rendered a conclusion of similar concentrations.

**LRT Modeling.** It is reported that chemical properties, meteorological conditions and relative magnitudes of the pollutants’ concentrations in near-ground and advected air effect the transport of chemicals. The highest LRT potential was reported for HCB (hexachlorobenzene) with 110,000 km, while for most of the banned pesticides it ranged from 5200 (\( \alpha \)-HCH) to 100 km (aldrin) as characteristic travel distances in air. The distance was calculated as 4200–580 km in air from tetra to deca-CBs. Therefore, it can be concluded that most of the compounds measured in this study have LRT potential.

FLEXPART modeling showed that origin of air masses to Istanbul and Izmir were from eastern and northern Europe, western Russia, the Mediterranean and Aegean Sea areas as well as local (SI Tables S2 and S3). Local air masses arrived from possible contaminated areas such as the metropolitan areas of Istanbul, Kocaeli, and Izmir, while regional air masses mostly arrived from northern Africa, eastern Europe, and Russia. While in the latter cases, the residence time of air masses during the last days before arrival at the sites was often very short, the influence of local sources during advection shortly before arrival of air at the site cannot be excluded. Some of the samples (nos. 2, 9, 25, 27, 39, and 43) collected in Istanbul (SI Figure S1) were potentially influenced by the Izmir area, while some of the samples (nos. 3, 8, 15, 19, 20, 37, 41, 42, 46, 49, and 53) collected in Izmir (SI Figure S2) were potentially influenced by the Istanbul metropolitan area. Source regions predicted using backward simulations are presented for episodes with high levels of \( \sum \alpha \text{DDX} \), \( \sum \alpha \text{HCH} \), \( \sum \alpha \text{PCBs} \), and \( \sum \alpha \text{PBDEs} \) (Figure 2) in the following sections.

**OCPs.** Regions in northern Africa, eastern Europe, and Russia were indicated as potential source regions for \( \sum \alpha \text{DDX} \) for the Istanbul site, based on sample nos. 10/Ist, 17/Ist, 24/Ist, 25/Ist, and 27/Ist (SI Figure S1), with ≥95th percentile gas-phase \( \sum \alpha \text{DDX} \) concentrations. However, in particular for advection via the Marmara Sea (e.g., nos. 24/Ist, 25/Ist, 27/Ist) sources within western Turkey may have been influential. Sources within west Turkey were indicated to have the highest potential sources of \( \sum \alpha \text{HCHs} \) in many cases (see sample nos. 12/Ist, 24/Ist, and 47/Ist in SI Figure S1). Regional sources were also pointed by the samples measured in July 2014 (sample nos. 9/Ist to 12/Ist in SI Figure S1) and by the samples measured in March 2015 (sample nos. 44/Ist to 47/Ist in SI Figure S1) (had the highest particle phase \( \sum \alpha \text{HCHs} \) concentration). An \( \alpha \)-HCH/\( \gamma \)-HCH ratio of <1 points to the effects of regional sources, whereas >1 indicates the LRT. This ratio was found to be <1 for all months at Istanbul station (SI Figure S1), except May 2015 (2.54), in agreement with the residence time distribution graphs (sample nos. 83/Ist to 56/Ist in SI Figure S1). Samples collected from different areas around the Aegean Sea have shown that OCP levels in some part of Greece were higher than those of Izmir and Bursa, Turkey in our previous study. As well asKirchner et al. reported elevated atmospheric pentachlorobenzene, HCB, pentachloroanisole and ocachlorostyrene concentrations in central and eastern Europe including Ukraine and Russian Federation, in agreement with our study. The butter samples collected from Ukraine had higher levels of HCH and DDT species, compared to other European countries, except Romania. Atmospheric OCP levels in Libya have not been reported, however \( \sum \alpha \text{DDX} \) and \( \sum \alpha \text{HCHs} \) levels in human breast milk were detected to be higher than the maximum residue limit.
The contributions of the regions in northern Africa and southern Europe on ∑DDX levels are considerable for Izmir station (see sample nos. 2/Iz, 4/Iz, 38/Iz, 39/Iz, and 54/Iz with ≥95th percentile gas-phase ∑DDX concentrations in SI Figure S2). The sample nos. 40/Iz to 47/Iz (SI Figure S2) with dominant particle phase concentrations was influenced by the Marmara Sea area (particularly sample nos. 41/Iz, 42/Iz, and 46/Iz) and also the Aegean Region (west Turkey) (sample nos. 44/Iz and 45/Iz). Air masses passed over northern Africa and eastern Ukraine/southern Russia in January and February 2015 might have influenced the highest levels of ∑HCHs measured at the Izmir site (sample nos. 37–41/Iz in SI Figure S2). Again, the sampling events in November, December, and July 2014 and in March, April and May 2015 (ratios of α-HCH/γ-HCH ranged from 1.09 to 4.64, SI Figure S13) indicated that LRT could be the main source of HCHs in majority of the year in Izmir, in agreement with residence time distributions (SI Figure S2).

PCBs. The highly possible sources of ∑iPCBs for Istanbul sampling point were found to be in regions around the Black Sea as indicated by sample nos. 14–17/Ist (SI Figure S1) containing the highest gas-phase ∑iPCBs levels. The Black Sea was indicated to be the main potential source region which might be under the influence of sources on its shorelines. Apart from secondary sources from soils, also revolatilization following inversion of diffusive air–sea exchange of PCBs from polluted coastal waters are possible, as found elsewhere in the Eastern Mediterranean.63 PCB production was ended in Russia in 199360 but PCBs are still in use as the total amount of PCBs in PCB-containing equipment is approximately 27 000–35 000 tons.61 Russia has been reported to be one of the main emission regions of PCBs due to extensive use of PCBs in the past.62 The contribution of the Mediterranean and some adjacent countries (including Bulgaria) to the total European PCB emissions was reported to be about 25%.63 Coincidence of advection from N–NE, that is, across the Black Sea, with high levels in Istanbul are supported by few measurements in air from Eastern Europe (relevant for maxima found in sample nos. 14–17/Ist): PCBs were elevated in Leova, Moldova (ca. 150 km W of Odessa), ≈10 pg m⁻³ for ∑PCBs at least until the year 2013, and at Moğosoaia, Bulgaria (mountain site, ca. 450 km WNW of Istanbul), ≈10 pg m⁻³ for ∑PCBs in the year 2014.64 Ukraine, having an intensive steel production industry and yet a significant source of PCBs release also was reported as a potential source to Istanbul for PCBs.62 Athens, a metropolitan city of the Eastern Mediterranean Basin, was also reported to be a source for atmospheric pollutants.65 A wide spreading area over Athens to Izmir, then to Istanbul was also remarkable with a high residence time for sample no. 2/Ist with a higher ∑iPCBs concentration. The Aliaga industrial region in the Izmir area, with iron-steel plants and ship dismantling facilities which are major PCB emitters,39 was shown to have a high contribution to atmospheric PCBs in Istanbul.60 Electric arc furnaces that process ferrous scrap were determined as hot spots for POPs,38 and were reported to impact the Izmir metropolitan area.67,68

However, the concentrations of the other samples collected on dates indicating regional sources under the influence of southern winds (passing Aliaga, i.e., sample nos. 9/Ist, 27/Ist, 39/Ist, and 43/Ist) were found as about 1.5 times lower than the annual mean gas form ∑iPCBs concentration in Istanbul. There are also unintentional current sources. Mainly PCB-11, along with PCB-52 and -209 were identified as signature congeners for pigments in modern paints.69,70 Silicone-based adhesives were identified to be sources of mainly monochlorinated CBs, dominated by PCB-2 and -3, followed by dichlorinated CBs, in particular PCB-6, -11, and -13.71 Polymer resins in kitchen cabinetry were identified as a major source of PCB-47, PCB-51, and PCB-68.72 Target analytes of this study, however, included only PCB-52, not permitting elaboration on the current indirect sources.

Local sources in the metropolitan area itself were indicated to be dominant in Izmir (SI Figure S2). Potential LRT sources for PCBs to Izmir appeared to be in northern Africa, indicated by sample nos. 38–40/Iz (SI Figure S2) having the highest gas-phase ∑iPCBs levels. Oil, petrochemical, aluminum, iron, and steel production might be important sources of PCBs73 and yet the petrochemical industry is the backbone of the Libyan economy. No measurements are available to compare with from Libya, though. The PCB levels could be affected by the air flows from eastern Europe with respect to sample nos. 37/Iz and 50/Iz (SI Figure S2). In addition, the mean concentration of sample nos. 10/Iz, 15/Iz, 17/Iz, 26/Iz, and 29/Iz (SI Figure S2), of which residence times indicated local sources under the influence of northern winds (passing Aliaga), was about 2 times higher than the annual mean ∑iPCBs concentration at the Izmir site.
FLEXPART modeling showed that the highest ∑14PBDEs concentrations (sample nos. 33/Ist and 25/Ist in SI Figure S1) may be associated with air masses originated from northern Africa, where there are no restrictive measures on PBDEs in Libya,78 and no information available on their atmospheric levels. Based on the quantity of industrial waste (34 × 10^4 tons/year) and composition (47% steel, metallurgical, mechanical, and electrical industries, followed by 3% wood, paper, and printing industries, and 2% textile, hosiery, and confection industries)79 in Libya, northern Africa could be a source of PBDEs. The region encompassing Albania, Greece, and northwestern Turkey is indicated as a potential source for ∑14PBDEs based on the sample nos. 24/Ist, 3/Ist, and 1/Ist (SI Figure S1). Besis et al.80 measured total concentration of indicator PBDEs as 18.8 pg/m3 in central Greece, and as 10.8 pg/m3 in Izmir. Dilovasi, a district of the Kocaeli metropolitan city in northwestern Turkey, is a heavily industrialized region with many companies in various sectors mainly including iron–steel, aluminum, chemicals, paint81,82 which may be sources of PBDE emissions. However, ∑14PBDEs concentration were not found to be elevated, that ranged from <L.O.D to 4.62 pg/m3, for the samples collected on dates indicating regional sources under the influence of Kocaeli (sample nos. 13/Ist, 16/Ist, 18/Ist, 19/Ist, 44/Ist, and 47/Ist in SI Figure S1).

The samples with high concentrations (nos. 42/Iz, 54/Iz, 40/Iz, and 38/Iz, SI Figure S2) implicated regions in northern Africa, southern and eastern Europe as potential source areas for Izmir. To the best knowledge of the authors, there are no reports of atmospheric PBDE levels in Ukraine, Libya, and Romania. Atmospheric PBDE levels in Florence, Italy,78 were found to be comparable to levels of samples collected from different countries but PBDE 209 levels in Florence was among the highest in Europe. Regional sources also have high contribution to ∑14PBDEs detected in Izmir station (sample no. 19/Iz in SI Figure S2). Aliaga area was reported to be a source of atmospheric PBDEs.73 The mean concentrations of the other samples under the influence of northern winds (passing Aliaga, for sample nos. S/Iz, 10/Iz, 15/Iz, 17/Iz, 26/Iz, 29/Iz, and 48/Iz in SI Figure S2) were 16 pg/m3, about 1.6 times higher than the annual mean ∑14PBDEs concentration.

Consistent monitoring of air concentrations of POPs in the environment is the key activity to assess the effectiveness of international efforts to minimize the release of the chemicals to the environment. POPs monitoring under the Global Monitoring Plan of the Stockholm Convention includes few stations in eastern Europe (run by the EMEP and MONET programs).77

**Temperature Dependence.** The temperature dependence of POP concentrations in air can be used to infer on LRT. Thermodynamically, the gas-phase behavior of semivolatile organic compounds can be described with Clausius–Clapeyron (C–C) equation (ln P = (ΔHv/R)(1/T) + b), where P is partial pressure (atm), T is temperature (K), ΔHv is the heat of vaporization (kJ mol⁻¹) that is referred as the enthalpy of surface-air exchange (ΔHSA), and R is the universal gas constant. The regression of ln P versus 1/T being linear (ln P = m(1/T) + b), negative-steep slopes indicate the effect of local emissions while shallow or positive slopes point to the effect of LRT. Hoff et al.83 investigated nonlinearity of C–C plot for chlordane and concluded that a linear C–C plot with a high R² value implies dominance of only one exchange process, while a positive curvature, especially at low ambient temperatures, indicates the effect of LRT. However, it should be noted that C–C analysis could indicate local re-emission but not unintentional primary sources in urban and industrial areas.

There was only one significant correlation with very steep slope (for HEPT) in Istanbul suggesting its volatilization from a past contaminated area for southerly trajectories. For Izmir, on the other hand, the analysis indicated ∑DDX mainly originated from local sources based on southerly trajectories, whereas significant positive slopes for ∑DDX, HEPT, α-endo, mirex, and ∑PCBs for northerly trajectories indicated the effect of LRT. The analysis for individual PCB congeners resulted in positive slopes in Izmir. The slopes were significant (p < 0.1) for PCB-18, -22, -28, -44, -52, -56, -70, -74, -90, -99, -138, -141, -149, and -153 while the rest of the congeners had positive shallow slopes with no significance. In general, coefficient of determination levels were >0.3. In contrast to Izmir, a few congeners (PCB-44, -95, -110, and -149) resulted in negative significant slopes (p < 0.05) in Istanbul while they were not significant for the rest of the congeners. Temperature dependency for ∑4PCB and ∑2PBDE was reflective of the individual congeners, therefore, only the two are reported here. SI Table S8 presents results of Clausius–Clapeyron analysis for advection from northerly (315°–45°) and southerly (135°–225°) sectors. Inclusion of wind speed and direction as independent variables in addition to 1/T, and conducting multiple linear regression analysis yielded that individual congeners seldomly had significant relation with wind variables in agreement with previous research,77 therefore not presented here.

The FLEXPART analysis has generally shown southerly air flows in the higher concentrations days in January and February 2015 in Izmir. It is also reported that in winter time, west Turkey is under the influence of mainly easterly, southeasterly, southerly, and anticyclonic weather pattern, which increase PM10 concentrations to above average levels.80,81 Consequently, there is evidence that LRT may have a significant effect on POP levels in Izmir on top of local surface exchange and unintentional sources, that is, Aliaga Industrial Area and Izmir metropolitan area, which may even reach episodic levels that can mask the local sources.

Temperature dependency analysis was restated separately for northerly and southerly trajectory days since high concentrations occurred mainly with southerly advection. In general, the opposite to the characteristic pattern of temperature dependence of congeners was observed. Mandalakis and Stephanou investigated lack of seasonality in atmospheric PCB concentrations at a coastal area in the Mediterranean Sea.82 Some of the congeners were correlated positively but not significantly with temperature. They concluded that LRT, as a considerable source, along with the long sampling duration (24 h masking day–night time changes) and relatively narrow range of average wind speed could hide the seasonality of local emissions.

Overall, despite the widespread occurrence of monitoring studies on OCPs, PCBs, and PBDEs in other regions of the world, this study provided a year-long data set for Turkey, where POPs studies are not as widespread as in other regions and yet no continuous monitoring of POPs is available. The data obtained in this study do not follow the trend of
commonly reported results of the past studies, therefore, such interesting results could be useful, particularly for future research, and provides interesting insights into the atmospheric behavior/transport of these compounds on a regional level. This result raised a few questions and is somewhat unexpected and warrants further analysis. Moreover, the attempt to assess emission sources of the target analytes measured in this study was not very successful due to lack of POPs data from potential emission sources of the target analytes measured in this study. Therefore, for a better regional/continental emissions evaluation of POPs as well as assessment of complement with Stockholm Convention, there is certainly a need for long-term and continuous monitoring of these chemicals in the region.

**ASSOCIATED CONTENT**

Supporting Information
The Supporting Information is available free of charge at https://pubs.acs.org/doi/10.1021/acs.est.0c06272.

Figures S1–S13 and Tables S1–S8. Maps showing residence times of air masses, partitioning of targeted chemicals, isomer ratios of HCHs, additional details on sampling dates, meteorological data, further details on chemicals, analytical standards and methods, details on QA/QC procedures, results of Clausius–Clapeyron analysis (PDF).

**AUTHOR INFORMATION**

Corresponding Authors
Perihan B. Kurt-Karakus — Bursa Technical University, Department of Environmental Engineering, Faculty of Environmental Engineering and Natural Sciences, 16310 Yildirim, Bursa, Turkey; orchid.org/0000-0001-6737-3475; Phone: +90-224-300 3406; Email: perihan.kurt@btu.edu.tr

Aysun Sofoğlu — Izmir Institute of Technology, Department of Chemical Engineering, 35430 Urla, Izmir, Turkey; Phone: +90-232-750 6650; Email: ayunsofo@iYTE.edu.tr

Authors
Elif Gungormus — Izmir Institute of Technology, Department of Environmental Engineering and Department of Chemical Engineering, 35430 Urla, Izmir, Turkey

Halil Celik — Akdeniz University, Department of Environmental Engineering, 07070 Antalya, Turkey

Kadir Gedik — Eskisehir Technical University, Department of Environmental Engineering, 26555 Eskisehir, Turkey

Marie D. Mulder — Masaryk University, Research Centre for Toxic Compounds in the Environment, Faculty of Science, Brno 62500, Czech Republic

Gerhard Lammel — Masaryk University, Research Centre for Toxic Compounds in the Environment, Faculty of Science, Brno 62500, Czech Republic; Max Planck Institute for Chemistry, Multiphasic Chemistry Dept., 55128 Mainz, Germany

Sait C. Sofoğlu — Izmir Institute of Technology, Department of Environmental Engineering, 35430 Urla, Izmir, Turkey

Eser Okten — Izmir Institute of Technology, Department of Environmental Engineering, 35430 Urla, Izmir, Turkey

Tugba Ugrancı — Izmir Institute of Technology, Department of Environmental Engineering, 35430 Urla, Izmir, Turkey

Askin Birgul — Bursa Technical University, Department of Environmental Engineering, Faculty of Engineering and Natural Sciences, 16310 Yildirim, Bursa, Turkey

Kevin C. Jones — Lancaster Environment Centre, Lancaster University, Lancaster LAI 4YQ, U.K.

Complete contact information is available at: https://pubs.acs.org/10.1021/acs.est.0c06272

**Notes**

The authors declare no competing financial interest.

**ACKNOWLEDGMENTS**

We acknowledge funding from Turkish Scientific and Technological Research Council (TUBITAK) for the financial support under the grant scheme of The Scientific and Technological Research Projects Funding Program (Grant No. 112Y315).

**REFERENCES**


(13) Yenisoy-Karakas, S.; Oz, M.; Gaga, E. O. Seasonal Variation, Sources, and Gas/Particle Concentrations of PCBs and OCPs at High Altitude Suburban Site in Western Black Sea Region of Turkey. J. Environ. Monit. 2012, 14 (5), 1365–74.


(22) TUIK Address Based Population Registration System Census. Turkish Statistical Institute, Ankara, Turkey, 2017.

(23) TUIK Gross Domestic Product by Province. Turkish Statistical Institute, Ankara, Turkey, 2014.


(74) CP/RAC Report on Brominated Flame- retardants in Mediterranean Countries. Regional Activity Centre for Cleaner Production (CP/RAC), Barcelona, Spain, 2009.


(80) Çapraz, Ö.; Deniz, A.; Particulate matter (PM10 and PM2.5) concentrations during a Saharan dust episode in Istanbul. *Air Qual., Atmos. Health* 2021, article in press (14109).
